

#### **Proactive Release**

The following documents have been proactively released by the Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet (DPMC), on behalf of Hon Andrew Little, Lead Coordination Minister for the Government's Response to the Royal Commission's Report into the Terrorist Attack on the Christchurch Mosques:

Government Response to the Royal Commission of Inquiry into the Terrorist Attack on Christchurch Masjidain – First Report Back

The following documents have been included in this release:

Title of paper: Government Response to the Royal Commission of Inquiry into the Terrorist attack on Christchurch Masjidain: First Report Back (CAB-21-SUB-0049 refers)

Title of minute: Government Response to the Royal Commission of Inquiry into the Terrorist Attack on Christchurch Masjidain: First Report Back (CAB-21-MIN-0049 refers)

Some parts of this information release would not be appropriate to release and, if requested, would be withheld under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act). Where this is the case, the relevant section of the Act that would apply has been identified. Where information has been withheld, no public interest has been identified that would outweigh the reasons for withholding it.

Recommendation 16 of the paper differs from recommendation 16 of the minute. The recommendation as phrased in the minute reflects Cabinet's preference.

#### **Key to redaction codes:**

- Section 6(a), to protect the security or defence of New Zealand or the international relations of the Government of New Zealand;
- Section 9(2)(f)(iv), to maintain the confidentiality of advice tendered by or to Ministers and officials; and
- Section 9(2)(g)(i), to maintain the effective conduct of public affairs through the free and frank expression of opinion.

© Crown Copyright, Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International (CC BY 4.0)

Office of the Lead Coordination Minister for the Government's Response to the Royal Commission's Report into the Terrorist Attack on the Christchurch Mosques

Cabinet

# Government response to the Royal Commission of Inquiry into the terrorist attack on Christchurch masjidain – first report back

## **Proposal**

This paper provides Cabinet with an update on the Government's response to the Royal Commission of Inquiry into the terrorist attack on Christchurch masjidain (the Royal Commission) and community hui that have occurred in recent months.

## Relation to government priorities

The importance of responding appropriately to the Royal Commission was outlined in the Speech from the Throne, which emphasised the need to 'create a New Zealand where all people feel safe, have equal access to opportunities and do not experience discrimination'. The programme of work to be developed in response to the Royal Commission is one of the most important opportunities to deliver on this objective.

## **Executive Summary**

- 3 Since the Royal Commission's report was received by the Government, on 26 November 2020, Ministers have led nationwide hui to understand ethnic and minority faith communities' priorities and ensure Government is aware of all relevant issues. Feedback from the hui has informed the actions and recommendations in this paper, including the prioritisation of work over the coming months.
- Initiatives which were funded in December 2020 as part of the initial response are progressing satisfactorily. The majority of the initiatives are currently in preparation for being formally established on or after 1 July 2021.
- 5 Two initiatives will be established as soon as practicably possible:
  - 5.1 A diverse Implementation Oversight Advisory Group of 20-30 individuals will contribute to the Government response and help to hold Government to account by ensuring the work programme is progressed with an appropriate understanding of community perspectives;

- 5.2 A Community Capability Building Initiative will be established to provide a modest amount of contestable funding to support engagement and capacity building in ethnic and minority faith communities. The need for such a fund, which is not *haram* ('forbidden') for being underwritten by the proceeds of gambling, is in my view one of the most pressing needs to respond to what I heard in the hui.
- Also as part of the short term work, further advice is being sought in response to feedback from the community hui on the following three areas: employment discrimination, racism and cultural competency in schools, and portrayal of Muslims in the media.
- 7 The Government response also includes two long term priorities which reflect machinery of government and wider societal change work streams: national security and social cohesion.

## **Background**

- The events of 15 March 2019 were unprecedented in New Zealand; 51 people lost their lives, many more were injured, and communities were scarred. The terrorist attack was perpetrated against people participating in peaceful religious observance. People around the country had their sense of safety affected through exposure to violence and extremism never before experienced in New Zealand. The terrorist attack was an attack on New Zealand, but more directly an attack on our Muslim community.
- In November 2020, the Government received the report of the Royal Commission of Inquiry into the terrorist attack on Christchurch masjidain (the Royal Commission).
- 10 Cabinet agreed with the Royal Commission's findings, agreed in-principle with the report's 44 recommendations, and agreed funding for initiatives which could be implemented rapidly in response to the report [CAB-20-MIN-0513 Minute and CAB-20-MIN-0516 Minute refer].
- 11 Cabinet directed officials to report back in February 2021 on the implementation of the funded initiatives, as well as initial advice on a longer-term programme of work that will aim to meet the overall intent of the Royal Commission's recommendations [CAB-20-MIN-0516 Minute refers]. This paper provides that report-back, which has been extended to allow completion of community hui.

## The Government has already taken immediate action in response to the Report

In December, the Government announced its immediate response to the Royal Commission Report. This included relevant work streams that were already underway and new initiatives to immediately act on some of the recommendations. A progress update on these initiatives is provided below.

## Collective Impact Board and ongoing wrap-around services

- Work is underway to establish a Collective Impact Board and enhance services to meet the ongoing needs of affected whānau, survivors and witnesses. This is in line with recommendations 25 and 26 of the Royal Commission's report, and reflects feedback from the hui.
- MSD has received informal feedback from affected communities, community groups and agencies to develop options on how the Collective Impact Board might be established and who needs to be involved.
- MSD intends to open nominations for the Collective Impact Board on or soon after 15 March 2021 and have the Board operational in early May 2021. The intensive case management service through which support has been provided to people affected by the attack remains in place and will be enhanced and developed, guided by the Collective Impact Board once established.

## Establishment of the Ministry for Ethnic Communities

- In response to requests from ethnic communities and in line with recommendation 30 of the Royal Commission report, the Office of Ethnic Communities will be upgraded to become the Ministry for Ethnic Communities from 1 July 2021.
- 17 The Minister for Diversity, Inclusion and Ethnic Communities will submit a Cabinet paper prior to the establishment of the Ministry making recommendations about its functions and responsibilities.
- The Public Service Commissioner will appoint an interim chief executive to lead the Ministry for Ethnic Communities from 1 July 2021. Recruitment for a substantive chief executive will commence later this year following Cabinet decisions on the functions and mandate of the Ministry.

## Establishment of the Ethnic Communities Graduate Programme

In response to recommendation 35 of the Royal Commission report and a desire to improve government and public sector leadership on social inclusion, Cabinet agreed to commence a graduate programme for ethnic communities.

- The Office of Ethnic Communities is seeking to have the first intake of 15 graduates commence work in July 2021, and the second in January 2022.
- Bids for placements in the July intake of the programme are expected from all departments with capacity to support a graduate to ensure full subscription.

## Te Raranga

- Te Raranga is a four-year programme to formalise Police's policy approach and operational practice that oversees and drives improvements in frontline practice to identify, record, and manage hate crime, and deliver a service that is more responsive to victims. New Zealand Police has defined their initial programme scope, structure and workplan, and held an engagement hui with internal stakeholders to capture all work currently underway.
- Prior to 1 July 2021, New Zealand Police will complete recruitment of programme team staff, engage with stakeholders to refine programme of work with their input, and progress training to improve capability.

## Multi-Agency Coordinated Intervention Programme

- 24 Since 15 March 2019, Police have been developing a more formalised and integrated approach to counter-terrorism. The Royal Commission report noted that Police have now implemented a recommendation made in 2015 for a dedicated role focused on coordinating prevention work, with a national prevention coordinator leading a newly created Multi-Agency Coordination and Intervention Programme (MACIP).
- Establishment of a governance group of senior level executives of relevant agencies for the Multi-Agency Coordinated Intervention Programme (MACIP) is underway. The programme will work with individuals displaying concerning behaviour and try to prevent them from radicalising by providing wrap around services and support. 9(2)(f)(iv), 9(2)(g)(i)

  The

programme is due to be fully up and running by end of the year.

## Increase the capacity of the Human Rights Commission

The HRC is engaging with the community to better understand what particular aspects would be most useful and appreciated by the public in order for them to strengthen their response to hate speech, racism and discrimination.

#### Update Hate Speech Legislation

The Minister of Justice is leading work to strengthen the incitement provisions in the Human Rights Act 1993. Cabinet gave in-principle agreement to proposals for changes and the Ministry of Justice is now planning 9(2)(f)(iv), as well as cross-party parliamentary discussions. 9(2)(f)(iv)This work aligns with the intent of recommendation 40 of the Royal Commission report, and it has been reiterated as a priority for the community through the hui.

## Amendments to counter-terrorism legislation

The Counter Terrorism Legislation Bill is currently being drafted, and amends the Terrorism Suppression Act 2002, and the Terrorism Suppression (Control Orders) Act 2019. 9(2)(f)(iv)

This marks the first stage in consideration and implementation of recommendation 18 of the Royal Commission report.

Trial to support young children to improve self-regulation, resilience and social skills

- The Ministry of Education is working to develop and pilot a suite of tools and resources for teachers to test a play-based social and emotional development programme for children up to six years, in order to improve their self-regulation, resilience and social skills. This reflects research led by Professor Richie Poulton using the Dunedin Study which found that childhood self-control does influence adult outcomes. The Ministry of Education intends to appoint a provider in April and implementation will begin from 1 July 2021.
- The Ministry of Education will also be continuing their existing work with minority ethnic communities in Christchurch to empower and equip parents, families and communities to champion their children's education until funding expires in June 2021.

## Accession to the Budapest Convention on Cybercrime

Following public consultation, Cabinet has confirmed its intention to accede to the Budapest Convention on Cybercrime, an international treaty seeking to address internet and computer crime, by aligning nations' laws, facilitating information-sharing on current threats and best practice and increasing international cooperation. Next steps include Parliamentary Treaty Examination and drafting of an omnibus bill to amend the Crimes Act 1961, the Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters Act 1992, the Search and Surveillance Act 2012 and the Customs and Excise Act 2018. 9(2)(f)(iv)

#### Extension of the Safer Communities Fund

The second tranche of Safer Communities Fund will open on 10 March 2021 to provide communities with additional funding to upgrade and implement security measures that will reduce the threat and fear from a potential attack. Applications will close on 5 May, and applicants will be notified of decisions by 31 May 2021.

#### Establishment of the National Centre of Excellence

- In response to recommendation 14 of the Royal Commission's report, DPMC has been in discussions with tertiary institutions to confirm their interest in being part of the National Centre of Excellence which will focus on violent extremism, radicalisation, diversity and social inclusion.
- We expect the final concept for the National Centre of Excellence to be completed in the first half of 2021, and the centre to be established in the second half of the year.



# Community engagement has been a top priority since Royal Commission report delivery

- Promoting and ensuring New Zealand community safety and wellbeing lies at the heart of the Government's response to the Royal Commission. That response is not limited by the recommendations of the Royal Commission and can go further in a number of areas, in line with the overall intent of the report and community feedback.
- In the period after the public release of the Royal Commission report engagement was appropriately prioritised with affected whānau and survivors of the *shuhada* ('martyrs') in Christchurch.
- During January and February 2021 Ministers undertook 33 community hui with Muslim, other faith and pan-ethnic communities. The objectives of the hui were to:
  - 38.1 continue to build strong, trusted relationships between these communities and Government as the basis for long-term partnerships,

- 38.2 listen to reactions around the report and answer questions,
- 38.3 provide information about initiatives underway,
- 38.4 understand the key priority issues for communities to inform the development of the Government response,
- 38.5 begin a dialogue on how communities can work together with us in shaping the substance of the response and an implementation work programme, and
- 38.6 discuss and invite views on the establishment of the Implementation Oversight Advisory Group (recommendation 44 of the Royal Commission's report).
- The community hui were led by me and the Minister for Diversity, Inclusion and Ethnic Communities, with participation from Members of Parliament from both sides of the House. Officials from a range of agencies including the Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet (DPMC), Office of Ethnic Communities, New Zealand Security Intelligence Service (NZSIS), Ministry of Social Development, Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment (Immigration NZ), Police, the Ministry of Education (MoE), as well as the Human Rights Commission (HRC) attended many of the hui.
- Based on consistently expressed feedback at the hui, and through feedback collected from paper forms and online, key community priorities include:
  - 40.1 educational reform to provide culture change and address existing structural racism through curriculum change and improving the cultural competency of principals and school teachers;
  - 40.2 addressing the role of media in perpetuating discrimination and racism;
  - 40.3 addressing employment discrimination and providing more employment pathways for ethnic communities;
  - 40.4 increasing the diversity and cultural competency of the public sector workforce, particularly at senior levels;
  - 40.5 increasing resources to communities to enable their full participation in civil society and to allow for community-led solutions;
  - 40.6 provision of ongoing long-term support to the affected whānau and survivors of the 15 March attack;
  - 40.7 government accountability to communities and a desire for transparency and community involvement in policy development, to include seeing outcomes from their feedback;
  - 40.8 improving the safety of New Zealanders, including through firearms control as well as hate speech/crime legislation;

- 40.9 an appropriately tasked Ministry for Ethnic Communities that has meaningful status for communities and within the public service;
- 40.10 the need for a long-term work programme on social cohesion that brings together all communities to bring about societal change.
- Officials will produce a summary of community input from these hui and other forms of feedback. This report will be published in English and Arabic on the DPMC website.

## Moving from consultation to action

- Many ethnic and minority faith community members who attended hui have been consulted in previous forums prior to the 15 March 2019 and by the Royal Commissioners. They are keen for government to progress from consultation to action, understanding however that some of the recommendations in the Royal Commission's report can be implemented quickly and that others will take more time.
- Nevertheless, conversations with communities who have not yet been formally consulted can and should proceed while implementation progresses.
- DPMC is investigating the possibility of deploying a specialised digital engagement tool to continue the conversation with those who wish to engage. Additionally, existing channels such as a dedicated email address and direct engagement between the Office of Ethnic Communities and stakeholders will continue to operate.

#### **Short term priorities**

Based on community feedback to date, and the recommendations of the report, I am proposing the next steps include short term priorities, and a number of larger overhaul programmes to occur over the longer term.

## Establishment of the Implementation Oversight Advisory Group

- A transparent, trusted and effective Implementation Oversight Advisory Group, as outlined at recommendation 44, will underpin our ability to create an overarching Royal Commission response implementation work programme.
- 47 Feedback from the hui was the Implementation Oversight Advisory Group needs to be involved in the response to the Royal Commission from the beginning, and should not be provided with 'fait accompli' solutions. As such, an implementation work programme will not be agreed until Ministers have the opportunity to review advice from agencies and from this group.
- The Implementation Oversight Advisory Group will function as a Ministerial Advisory Group, providing advice directly to me as Lead Coordination Minister for the Government's Response to the Royal Commission's Report into the Terrorist Attack on the Christchurch Mosques.

- Due to the high level of public interest in the Royal Commission and the Government response, and the nature and extent of public involvement in outreach, it is important that there is a transparent public recruitment and appointment process.
- Officials are currently designing a nomination process, determining secretariat support for the group, drafting a terms of reference, analysing options for Chair selection, evaluating security and privacy concerns that will need to be taken into account in forming the group, and determining the financial implications for the group including pay for members of the group, in line with the Cabinet Fees Framework.
- Nominations for the Implementation Oversight Advisory Group are expected to be called for by 15 March 2021 with initial costs met from DPMC baselines.

## Establishment of the Community Capacity Building Initiative

- Feedback from the hui showed there is a paucity of culturally or religiously-appropriate funding for community development to respond to the Royal Commission report's recommendations. This has had a peculiar effect whereby Government agencies with asymmetric resources inadvertently place unrealistic pressure on small community groups with no paid staff, to engage across many topics and 'speak for the community'. Some groups report repeating themselves prior to 15 March 2019, then to the Royal Commissioners, and now to Ministers all while caring for a devastated community that has lost 51 of its members.
- While the Ministry for Ethnic Communities, once fully established is expected to work toward facilitating this type of support, in the interim there remains a need for community-led engagement and development.
- Accordingly, I will establish a contestable fund that ethnic and minority faith communities can access, in order to both support individual initiatives as well as building long-term capability to contribute to the Royal Commission response. Importantly, the fund will be accessed by application and will not be funded through proceeds of gambling which is *haram*.
- 55 Initial establishment funding will come from DPMC baselines.
- 56 The fund will be prioritised to deliver funding for groups most directly affected by the terror attack and the Royal Commission, particularly where government has an ongoing need to engage with these groups as work programme for responding to the Royal Commission is finalised. Salaries, training, and travel for staff will be able to be met through the fund.
- I intend that the fund will be \$1 million over three years. A review of the fund, including which groups have accessed it and the capacity that has been built accordingly, will be undertaken after two years, in order to determine the ongoing need for this support.

The fund will be administered by the Department of Internal Affairs, who have extensive experience in administering such funds. Applications will be assessed by the DPMC and the Ministry for Ethnic Communities.

## Employment discrimination in government and in the private sector

- Discrimination in employment is continuing to have a significant impact on wellbeing for many. Our new Ethnic Communities' Graduate Programme will help to provide a pathway into the public service as is reflected in recommendation 35, however there is more to do to improve diversity of leadership within the public service, and in general across the private sector.
- The Public Service Act strengthens and supports our diversity and inclusion commitments. The legislation explicitly requires chief executives to pursue fairness and diversity and to foster a workplace that is inclusive for all.
- As part of the next steps of the Government response, the Minister for Public Service will seek further advice on how to improve diversity and inclusion in the Public Service. Chief executives and agencies are implementing a range of measures under the Diversity and Inclusion work programme and have signed up to deliver a series of commitments including training programmes, guidance and resources on:
  - 61.1 cultural competence,
  - 61.2 addressing all forms of bias,
  - 61.3 inclusive leadership,
  - 61.4 building relationships with employees,
  - 61.5 and tools and resourcing for employee-led networks.
- Beyond the public service, the Associate Minister for Social Development and Employment is leading the development of the Refugees, Recent Migrants and Ethnic Communities Employment Action Plan. This will bring together key work programmes and propose new actions to create a better labour market connection for a range of migrant and ethnic communities, for example developing workplace-focused presentation resources on inclusive work environments and exploring mentoring opportunities.

## Cultural competency of teachers, principals and school leadership teams

A theme prevalent throughout community engagement as noted was the need for change in the education sector, particularly to address racism and improve cultural competency. Currently MoE regionally allocates funds for Professional Learning and Development (PLD) opportunities. Cultural capability is now one of four new priorities that underpin regionally-allocated PLD in English medium settings.

- A specific request heard at every hui was for religious and cultural diversity (but not proselytisation) to be taught in schools.
- MoE has also advised that they will be considering how to work better with communities to give effect to the Royal Commission's report, including more resources about religion and diversity and supporting whole school communities as they work together to build caring and inclusive cultures. This also includes work to promote wellbeing and prevent and respond to racism, discrimination and bullying in accordance with the recently promulgated National Education and Learning Priorities (NELPs). The Minister of Education and Associate Minister of Education will report back to Cabinet on proposed next steps before the end of the year.

## Media's portrayal of Muslim communities

- During consultation, there was ongoing concern raised about the role of the media in perpetuating harmful portrayals of Muslims, or not portraying them at all.
- I am aware of a wish by some community organisations to promote a constructive dialogue with media outlets in the way those communities are sometimes depicted. The Minister for Broadcasting and Media will seek to see how he can assist to facilitate a constructive dialogue.

## Longer term priorities

Though consideration and analysis has already begun, many of the recommendations will take much longer to be fully worked through, consulted with communities, costed and implemented. I intend to phase the response to the Royal Commission accordingly, to ensure that we are focusing on areas of high interest and importance to the community, taking a longer-term view of issues requiring system-level work and significant consultation with communities, and working in line with Government's principles for response.

## Strategic Approaches to National Security and Social Cohesion

- Advice to Cabinet in December 2020 signalled the need for strategic approaches to national security and social cohesion—mutually reinforcing concepts in our vision for a diverse, inclusive and safe New Zealand.
- 70 The Associate Minister for Social Development and Employment will lead a programme of short, medium and longer term work to improve social cohesion 9(2)(f)(iv)

## National Security Settings

A review of the overarching policy settings that underpin our approach to national security is crucial to embedding change and giving effect to the intent of the Royal Commission, which is broader than the 44 recommendations.

- Reviewing the overarching national security strategic policy settings—including our objectives, priorities, and strategic approach—will build on the content and implicit recommendations of the Royal Commission and internal reviews undertaken by national security agencies. It will ensure that national security policy settings align with the Government's broader focus on wellbeing and creating a fairer New Zealand, and account for a dynamic strategic environment with new mechanisms for emerging risk identification.
- Any improved approach to national security should be developed in response to the broad range of risks and concerns facing New Zealand's diverse communities, not just the threat of terrorism and violent extremism, as was the focus of the Royal Commission. This process will be carried out in conjunction with iwi, communities, civil society and academia to give effect to the intent of the Royal Commission, fostering a new public conversation on national security and focusing on identifying practical actions that the public can take to contribute to our national security, and culminating in a strategy for how government in partnership with the public will pursue national security aims.
- This review, which will also provide analysis to support any machinery of government and accountabilities changes, will take some time to occur properly. I will seek updates through the Minister for National Security and Intelligence on a quarterly basis, beginning in the third quarter of the year, and will provide a formal update to Cabinet before the end of 2021.

## Social Cohesion Settings

- 75 The Minister for Diversity, Inclusion and Ethnic Communities has been given responsibility and accountability for coordinating a whole-of-government approach to building social cohesion, as part of her Associate Social Development and Employment portfolio. The Ministry of Social Development is the lead agency for this work. This delivers on recommendation 28 in the Royal Commission's report, which focuses on coordinating a whole-of-government approach to building social cohesion; recommendation 29 calls for the development of a social cohesion strategic framework.
- The Associate Minister for Social Development and Employment is recommending that we adopt the term and definition as set out in the report "A socially cohesive society is one where all individuals and groups have a sense of:
  - 76.1 belonging being part of a community, trust in others and respect for the law;
  - 76.2 inclusion equity of opportunities and outcomes;
  - 76.3 participation in social, community, political and civic life;
  - 76.4 recognition valuing diversity and respecting difference;
  - 76.5 legitimacy confidence in public institutions.

- Work to improve social cohesion needs to recognise Aotearoa New Zealand's bicultural foundations and be based on Te Tiriti o Waitangi principles, and incorporate Te Ao Māori approaches.
- To support lasting changes to culture and behaviour, the Minister is intending to develop a programme of work with a mix of short, medium and longer-term actions:
  - 78.1 Tangible actions are currently underway including establishment of an ethnic communities' graduate programme, updating hate speech legislation, and rolling out new resources in schools
  - 78.2 Medium term actions will include, but not be limited to, public conversations to develop an overarching social cohesion strategic framework and work programme to raise visibility and catalyse change, and a self-regulation pilot
  - 78.3 Longer term actions, that have been identified and prioritised with communities, to deliver on the work programme.

## **Next steps**

- The memorial events on 13 March 2021 and commemorations for the second anniversary on 15 March 2021 will provide an opportunity for New Zealand to reflect and take stock of the events of 15 March 2019 and all that has happened in the interim.
- We have indicated that we will provide a public update on progress towards implementation of recommendations during the first quarter of 2021. This will include the release of this Cabinet paper and feedback on what Government heard during the community hui.
- I will continue to convene quarterly meetings of Responsible Ministers the Prime Minister and Minister for National Security and Intelligence, Minister of Finance, Minister of Education, Minister for Social Development and Employment, Minister of Foreign Affairs, Minister of Police, Minister of Justice and Immigration, Minister of Internal Affairs, Minister of Customs and Minister for Diversity, Inclusion and Ethnic Communities, to consider current activities and give direction to officials on work priorities.
- I intend to formally report back to Cabinet on consideration of the recommendations, implementation of initiatives, and our longer-term national security and social cohesion settings, before the end of 2021.

## **Financial Implications**

While there are no direct financial implications from this paper, implementation of all of the Royal Commission's recommendations is a long term stream of work that will require sequencing and prioritising through different financial years.

## **Legislative Implications**

There are no direct legislative implications arising from this Cabinet paper. The Government's response to the Royal Commission will require multiple legislative amendments. Specific advice to Cabinet will be provided for each of these.

## **Impact Analysis**

## **Regulatory Impact Statement**

The initiatives proposed in this paper do not require Regulatory Impact Statements.

## **Population Implications**

- The attack on 15 March 2019 was against all New Zealanders, but most directly and most acutely affected our Muslim community. It is therefore appropriate that the victims, whānau, and wider Muslim communities are top of mind when considering the Royal Commission's report and the policy initiatives contained in this paper.
- The outcomes discussed in this paper look to address the racism and discrimination faced by minority religious and ethnic communities in many aspects of their day to day lives. The proposals in this paper will have a positive impact for minority religious and ethnic communities.
- Proposals which reduce the likelihood of radicalisation and improve social cohesion will have a positive impact on Māori, Pacific peoples, women, people with disabilities, rainbow communities, and gender diverse people.

## **Human Rights**

There are no human rights implications arising from the proposals within this paper.

#### Consultation

- 90 This paper was developed by DPMC (National Security Group).
- 91 Crown Law, Department of Corrections, Department of Internal Affairs (including the Office of Ethnic Communities), Government Communications Security Bureau, Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment, Ministry of Defence, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Social Development, New Zealand Customs Service, New Zealand Defence Force, New Zealand Security Intelligence Service, Public Service Commission, Statistics New Zealand and The Treasury were consulted on this paper and their views duly considered.

#### **Communications**

The updates contained within this paper will form the basis of remarks and public announcements by Ministers in March 2021.

#### **Proactive Release**

This paper will be proactively released following public communications about these updates. Redactions will be made in line with the provisions of the Official Information Act 1982.

#### Recommendations

The Lead Coordination Minister for the Government's Response to the Royal Commission's Report into the Terrorist Attack on the Christchurch Mosques recommends that the Committee:

- note that in December 2020, Cabinet agreed with the findings and agreed inprinciple with the recommendations of the Royal Commission of Inquiry into the terrorist attack on Christchurch masjidain [CAB-20-MIN-0365]
- agree that a phased approach to the Government's response to the Royal Commission is appropriate, with top priorities those directly related to support to affected communities and implementation mechanisms to enable the response and community input
- note that between December 2020 and February 2021, the Lead Coordination Minister for the Government's Response to the Royal Commission's Report into the Terrorist Attack on the Christchurch Mosques and the Minister for Diversity, Inclusion and Ethnic Communities led a nation-wide programme of hui to listen to community concerns and ensure that the Government's response aligns with communities' needs
- 4 **note** that a summary of the hui feedback will be published in English and Arabic on the Department of Prime Minister and Cabinet website
- agree that the Implementation Oversight Advisory Group will function as a Ministerial Advisory Group, providing advice directly to the Lead Coordination Minister for the Government's Response to the Royal Commission's Report into the Terrorist Attack on the Christchurch Mosques
- agree that nominations for the Implementation Oversight Advisory Group will be called for by 15 March 2021 with initial costs met from DPMC baselines

- agree that a contestable *Community Capacity Building Initiative* fund be established, with initial establishment funding from DPMC baselines, so that ethnic and minority faith communities can access in order to both support individual initiatives as well as building long-term capability to contribute to the Royal Commission response
- agree that the *Community Capacity Building Initiative* fund will be administered by the Department of Internal Affairs, with applications assessed by the DPMC and the Ministry for Ethnic Communities
- agree that a review of the *Community Capacity Building Initiative* fund will be undertaken after two years, including which groups have accessed it and the capacity that has been built accordingly, in order to determine the ongoing need for this support
- note that undertaking a strategic review of national security settings culminating in a strategy for how government – in partnership with the public – will pursue national security aims, and developing a social cohesion strategic framework, are critical to giving effect to the Royal Commission's recommendations and intent
- note that MSD intends to open nominations for the Collective Impact Board on or soon after 15 March 2021 and have the Board operational in early May 2021. The intensive case management service through which support has been provided to people affected by the attack remains in place and will be enhanced and developed, guided by the Collective Impact Board once established.
- endorse the definition of a socially cohesive society, as outlined in the Royal Commission's, as one where 'all individuals and groups have a sense of:
  - 12.1 belonging being part of a community, trust in others and respect for the law
  - 12.2 inclusion equity of opportunities and outcomes
  - 12.3 participation in social, community, political and civic life
  - 12.4 recognition valuing diversity and respecting difference
  - 12.5 legitimacy confidence in public institutions
- note that Associate Minister for Social Development and Employment will lead a programme of short, medium and longer term work to improve social cohesion 9(2)(f)(iv)

- 14 note that the Minister for Diversity, Inclusion and Ethnic Communities will submit a Cabinet paper prior to the establishment of the Ministry for Ethnic Communities on 1 July 2021 making recommendations about its functions and responsibilities
- note that bids for placements in the July intake of the Ethnic Communities
  Graduate Programme are encouraged by all departments to ensure full
  subscription
- note that the Public Service Commissioner will appoint an acting chief executive to lead the Ministry for Ethnic Communities from 1 July 2021 and that recruitment for a substantive chief executive will commence later in 2021 following cabinet decisions on the functions and mandate of the Ministry
- 17 note the importance of New Zealand's bicultural foundations and of building on Te Tiriti o Waitangi Principles and Te Ao Māori approaches to achieve a socially cohesive society
- note that the Minister for Public Service and the Associate Minister for Social Development and Employment will lead work to contribute to the Government response to the Royal Commission Report to address discrimination in employment in the public and private sectors
- note that the Associate Minister for Social Development and Employment is leading the development of the Refugees, Recent Migrants and Ethnic Communities Employment Action Plan to bring together key work programmes and propose new actions to create a better labour market connection for a range of migrant and ethnic communities
- 20 note that the Ministry of Education regionally allocates funds for Professional Learning and Development (PLD) opportunities. Cultural capability is now one of four new priorities that underpin regionally-allocated PLD in English medium settings
- 21 **note** that the Minister of Education and Associate Minister of Education will report back to Cabinet before the end of the year with proposals on how to support whole school communities as they work together to build caring and inclusive cultures, including work to promote wellbeing and prevent and respond to racism, discrimination and bullying, including how government might respond to the specific request heard hui for religious and cultural diversity (but not proselytisation) to be taught in schools
- 22 **note** that the Minister for Broadcasting and Media will seek to see how he can assist to facilitate a constructive dialogue between media organisations and the Muslim community regarding that community's concern about the role of media in perpetuating harmful portrayals of Muslims, or not portraying them at all

- 23 **note** that quarterly updates on consideration and implementation of the Royal Commission's report will be provided to the Prime Minister and Minister for National Security and Intelligence, Minister of Finance, Minister of Education, Minister for Social Development and Employment, Minister of Foreign Affairs, Minister of Police, Minister of Justice and Immigration, Minister of Internal Affairs, Minister of Customs and Minister for Diversity, Inclusion and Ethnic Communities as the suite of Responsible Ministers
- 24 note that the Lead Coordination Minister for the Government's Response to the Royal Commission's Report into the Terrorist Attack on the Christchurch Mosques will report to Cabinet with an update on consideration and implementation of the Royal Commission's recommendations and intent before the end of 2021

Authorised for lodgement

Hon Andrew Little

Lead Coordination Minister for the Government's Response to the Royal Commission's Report into the Terrorist Attack on the Christchurch Mosques

## Appendix A: Update on Royal Commission's recommendations

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
1	National Security –	Prime Minister	This recommendation will be considered a	9(2)(f)(iv)
	Appointment of a	Ardern	part of the strategic review of New Zealar	nd's
	Minister with		national security policy settings and along	side
	responsibility and	Prime Minister's	recommendations 2 and 3 for broader	
	accountability to lead	Office/DPMC	machinery of government changes.	
	and coordinate the CT			
	effort			
2	National Security -	Prime Minister	As part of our longer-term priorities,	
	Establish a new	Ardern	9(2)(f)(iv)	
	national intelligence		W	vill be
	and security agency	DPMC (with Te	informed by the strategic review of	
	(NISA) that is well-	Kawa Mataaho)	New Zealand's national security policy	
	resourced and		settings.	
	legislatively mandated		10	
	to be responsible for	•		
	strategic intelligence	X		
	and security leadership			
	functions.			

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
3	National Security – Investigate alternative mechanisms to the voluntary nature of the Security and Intelligence Board, including the establishment of an Interdepartmental Executive Board.	Prime Minister Ardern DPMC (with Te Kawa Mataaho)	As part of our long-term priorities, 9(2)(f)(iv)  An initial analysis of interim options for change is underway, to make improvements to the accountabilities and governance model used by the Security and Intelligence Board ahead of broader consideration of national security system changes.	9(2)(f)(iv)
4	National Security – Develop and implement a public facing CT/CVE strategy.	Prime Minister Ardern  DPMC (with CTCC agencies)	New Zealand's 'Countering terrorism and violent extremism national strategy' was released in February 2020. The strategy didn't have a formal launch and has received limited attention from communities.  Officials will look to review the strategy, to ensure it is effective and fit-for-purpose, in line with the review of our national security strategic settings.	

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
5	Performance – amend the Public Finance Act 1989 to require the intelligence and security agencies to provide performance information that can be the subject of a performance audit by the Auditor-General.	Minister Robertson Treasury (with NZSIS/GCSB)	Treasury is consulting with the Office of the Auditor General and the NZSIS/GCSB to determine the barriers to accessing information and the current avenues to ensure that performance information is fully available to the Auditor-General and other central agencies.  Initial scoping suggests that this recommendation may best be implemented through operational rather than legislative change. This could be undertaken through the enhancement of existing processes, procedures and engagements to facilitate free and frank information sharing.	9(2)(f)(iv)
6	National Security – Strengthen the role of the Intelligence and Security Committee (ISC).	Prime Minister Ardern ISC, DPMC	Preliminary analysis of options for strengthening the role of the ISC is underway. At the first meeting of the ISC on 24 February, members resolved to hold further meetings of the Committee to receive briefings on topics discussed in the report of the Royal Commission. Any legislative change required to change the ISC will occur as part of broader consideration of the Intelligence and Security Act 2017.	

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
7	National Security – establish an Advisory Group on CT.	Prime Minister Ardern  DPMC (with SIB and CTCC agencies)	Implementation Oversight Advisory Group under recommendation 44.  Options for establishing a CT Advisory Group will be developed following formation of the establishment of the National Centre for	9(2)(f)(iv)
8	National Security – include a summary of advice from the Advisory Group and actions taken in response, when providing advice on the National Security and Intelligence Priorities and annual threatscape report.	Prime Minister Ardern DPMC	This is reliant on recommendation 7 above.	
9	National Security – improve intelligence and security information-sharing practices.	Minister Little DPMC	This initiative is subject to sequencing.	

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
10	National Security – direct access agreements.	Minister Little  DPMC  NZSIS/GCSB	Recommended changes to the Intelligence and Security Act 2017 will be considered as a whole, alongside the range of issues identified within the body of the report and any others also identified by agencies and the Inspector-General of Intelligence and Security. This is important to ensure the coherence of the overall legislative framework for the intelligence and security agencies remains intact. Development of high-level policy options for responding to issues contained within the Intelligence and Security Act is underway.	9(2)(†)(iv)
11	Information Access - security clearances and appropriate access to information management systems and facilities.	Minister Little  NZSIS, GCSB, DPMC, MBIE	NZSIS continues to achieve efficiencies through continuous improvement work on the security clearance vetting pipeline. 6(a), 9(2)(f)(iv), 9(2)(g)(i)	

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
			6(a), 9(2)(f)(iv), 9(2)(g)(i)	9(2)(f)(iv)
12	Law enforcement –		9(2)(f)(iv)	
	Develop and promote an accessible reporting	Williams		
	system that enables	Police, DIA,	10	
	members of the public	NZSIS,		
	to easily and safely	CTCC Agencies		
	report concerning			
	behaviours or incidents			
	to a single contact point within government.	0		

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
			Police is planning to implement system enhancements to ensure any hate / prejudice crime that has come in via the existing reporting channel (105) is highlighted automatically. Operator training, and this system enhancement will support the identification of these crimes and ensure they are brought to urgent attention for assessment.	9(2)(f)(iv)
13	Terrorism Indicators – Develop and publish indicators and risk factors that illustrate for the public specific behaviours that may demonstrate a person's potential for engaging in violent extremism and terrorism and update them regularly as the threatscape evolves.	Minister Little  NZSIS, Police, CTCC Agencies	As noted in the last Cabinet paper, NZSIS has completed a classified terrorism indicators framework for the New Zealand context. The framework has been incorporated into NZSIS' internal case management and prioritisation framework. Work on making the indicators publicly available is in progress and requires further work with Police.	

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
14	National Security – establish a programme to fund independent NZ-specific research.	Prime Minister Ardern DPMC	The National Centre of Excellence will be established to address this recommendation.	9(2)(f)(iv)
15	National Security – create opportunities to improve public understanding on violent extremism and terrorism in NZ, with ongoing public discussions.	Prime Minister Ardern DPMC and Minister for NSI (MSD, MOJ)	The National Centre of Excellent will be established to address this recommendation. An annual hui, as per recommendation 16 below, will also provide opportunities to increase public information and understanding of New Zealand-specific elements of violent extremism and terrorism.	
16	National Security – establish an annual hui on CVE and CT.	Prime Minister Ardern DPMC	DPMC are planning for a first hui on counter- terrorism and countering violent extremism in the 2020-2021 financial year. This will be developed in conjunction with academic institutions and communities. The hui will also respond to recommendation 15, and will contribute to the establishment of the National Centre of Excellence.	

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
17	National Security – require in legislation publication of the NSIPs and referral to ISC for consideration; publication of an annual threatscape report; and the ISC to receive and consider submissions on the NSIPs and threatscape report.	Prime Minister Ardern DPMC, NZSIS	As noted at recommendation 10 above, development of high-level policy options for responding to issues contained within the Intelligence and Security Act is underway.	9(2)(f)(iv)

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
18	Legislation – Review all	Minister Faafoi	The Minister of Justice has agreed to an	9(2)(f)(iv)
	legislation related to		ongoing stewardship programme to respond	
	the counter-terrorism	MoJ, DPMC,	to this recommendation. The programme	
	effort to ensure it is	Police,	includes reforms already underway or	
	current and enables	NZSIS/GCSB	scheduled. The Ministry will also work with	
	Public sector agencies		DPMC to coordinate a cross-government	
	to operate effectively,		review of legislation related to counter-	
	prioritising		terrorism to ensure it is fit for purpose. $9(2)(f)(iv)$	
	consideration of the		$\sim$	
	creation of precursor			
	terrorism offences in			
	the Terrorism			
	Suppression Act, the			
	urgent review of the		DPMC is developing advice on the high-level	
	effect of section 19 of		policy options for responding to issues	
	the Intelligence and		contained within the Intelligence and Security	
	Security Act on target		Act, including the section 19 issue raised in	
	discovery and acceding		this recommendation.	
	to and implementing			
	the Budapest			
	Convention.			

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
				9(2)(f)(iv)
19	Firearms – Direct New	Minister	This work is underway within Police's Arms	
	Zealand Police (or	Williams	Transformation Programme. This is a	
	other relevant entity) to make policies and operational standards and guidance for the firearms licensing system clear and consistent with the legislation.	Police	medium-term piece of work.	
20	Firearms – Direct New	Minister	Work on this recommendation is underway.	
	Zealand Police (or other relevant entity) to	Williams	Police has implemented an interim electronic solution while a more comprehensive solution	
	introduce an electronic	Police	is developed as part of a significant upgrade in	
	system for processing	AU.	its capability. As the Arms Transformation	
	firearms licence		Programme progresses the full firearms	
	applications.		registry, including firearms register, will be built.	

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
21	Firearms – Direct New	Minister	A new training programme for firearms	9(2)(f)(iv)
	Zealand Police (or	Williams	licensing staff is being progressively	
	other relevant entity) to		implemented, with initial training already	
	ensure firearms	Police	delivered. A new national and district quality	
	licensing staff have		assurance process and a new firearms licence	
	regular training and		application approval step (at a senior level)	
	undertake periodic		has recently been implemented.	
	reviews of the quality of			
	their work.			
22	Firearms - Direct New	Minister	Updated reporting framework is in place.	
	Zealand Police (or	Williams	Planning for new public confidence measures	
	other relevant entity) to		has commenced.	
	introduce performance	Police		
	indicators that focus on		. (/)	
	the effective			
	implementation of the			
	firearms licensing			
	system. Key indicators			
	should include			

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
	a. Regular			9(2)(f)(iv)
	performance			
	monitoring of			
	firearms licensing			
	staff to ensure			
	national standards		101	
	are met; and			
	b. Public			
	confidence in the		$\wedge \vee$	
	firearms licensing			
	system is increased			
	(as measured by			
	New Zealand Police			
	citizens' satisfaction			
	survey reports or		. (/) * *	
	similar mechanism).			

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
23	Firearms - Direct New	Minister	Police are proposing to publicly consult during	9(2)(f)(iv)
	Zealand Police (or	Williams	March/April 2021 on proposals for new	
	other relevant entity) to		regulations under the Arms Act 1983. Included	
	require two new	Police	is a proposal which sets out the new and	
	processes in the case		amended information required to be specified	
	of applicants who have		which relates to travel and residing overseas	
	lived outside of New		and referees. The regulations are expected to	
	Zealand for substantial		be in place <sup>9(2)(f)(iv)</sup>	
	periods of time in the			
	ten years preceding the			
	application:			
	a. Applicants			
	should be required			
	to produce police or			
	criminal history			
	checks from			
	countries in which			
	they have previously			
	resided; and			

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
	b. Firearms Vetting			9(2)(f)(iv)
	Officers should			
	interview family			
	members or other			
	close connections in		~0	
	other countries			
	using technology if			
	the applicant does			
	not have near			
	relatives or close			
	associates living in			
	New Zealand.			
24		Minister	Legislative change to the Arms Act 1983 is	
	mandatory reporting of	Williams	required to introduce a mandatory reporting	
	firearms injuries to New		requirement for health practitioners. 9(2)(f)(iv)	
	Zealand Police by	Police, MoH		
	health professionals.	*		
			Police and Health have commenced policy	
			work to address this recommendation.	

Direct the Ministry of Social Development to  Radhakrishnan (Kaiwhakaoranga), set up immediately after the attacks, continues to operate until the	#	Theme / Recommendation		Update	Upcoming Milestone
Work with relevant Public sector agencies and non-government organisations to facilitate coordinated access to ongoing recovery support for affected whānau, survivors and witnesses of the 15 March 2019 terrorist attack.  While the Collective Impact Board (Recommendation 26) is being established, MSD are progressing service improvements we can make now, in response to community feedback at the Royal Commission hui and in the Royal Commission report. MSD have also added work broker support and other employment support and are expanding their team through potential secondments from the Accident Compensation Corporation (ACC) and Immigration NZ, Te Kawa Mataaho  While the Collective Impact Board (Recommendation 26) is being established, MSD are progressing service improvements we can make now, in response to community feedback at the Royal Commission hui and in the Royal Commission report. MSD have also added work broker support and other employment support and are expanding their team through potential secondments from the Accident Compensation Corporation (ACC) and Immigration NZ,  Once established, the Collective Impact Board will work at pace to provide direction and guidance, by defining expectations and the parameters of the ongoing service.	25	Direct the Ministry of Social Development to work with relevant Public sector agencies and non-government organisations to facilitate coordinated access to ongoing recovery support for affected whānau, survivors and witnesses of the 15 March 2019 terrorist	Ministry of velopment to relevant otor agencies povernment ons to coordinated ongoing support for vhānau, and of the 15	(Kaiwhakaoranga), set up immediately after the attacks, continues to operate until the updated service is rolled out.  While the Collective Impact Board (Recommendation 26) is being established, MSD are progressing service improvements we can make now, in response to community feedback at the Royal Commission hui and in the Royal Commission report. MSD have also added work broker support and other employment support and are expanding their team through potential secondments from the Accident Compensation Corporation (ACC) and Immigration New Zealand to build capability.  Once established, the Collective Impact Board will work at pace to provide direction and guidance, by defining expectations and the	9(2)(f)(iv)

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
26	Recovery Support –	Minister	Work is underway to establish a Collective	9(2)(f)(iv)
	Investigate establishing	Radhakrishnan	Impact Board and enhance MSDs services to	
	a Collective Impact		meet the ongoing needs of affected whānau,	
	Network and Board or	MSD, Police,	survivors and witnesses.	
	other relevant	ACC, MoJ,		
	mechanism that	Immigration NZ,		
	enables Public sector	Te Kawa		
	agencies, non-	Mataaho		
	government			
	organisations and			
	affected whānau,			
	survivors and			
	witnesses to agree a			
	specific work			
	programme to provide		(/)	
	ongoing wrap-around			
	services to affected			
	whānau, survivors and			
	witnesses.			

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
27	Social and community	Minister	Initial advice to Ministers on options for scope,	9(2)(f)(iv)
	– discuss with whānau,	Radhakrishnan	relevant agency participation, and	
	survivors and		engagement with whānau, survivors and	
	witnesses what, if any,	DPMC	witnesses will be prepared over the coming	
	restorative justice		months.	
	process might be			
	desired, and how they		The Collective Impact Board (recommendation	
	would be designed and		26) will be key to delivering a range of support	
	resourced.		that might be related to restorative practice.	
28	Social Cohesion –	Minister	For the social cohesion recommendations,	
	Announce that the	Radhakrishnan	responsibility sits with a range of agencies and	
	Minister for Social		Ministers. Minister Radhakrishnan, as the	
	Development and	MSD, Social	Associate Minister for Social Development	
	Employment and the	Inclusion	and Employment and MSD have responsibility	
	Ministry of Social	Oversight	and accountability for coordinating the whole-	
	Development have	Group	of government approach to improving social	
	responsibility and		cohesion.	
	accountability for			
	coordinating a whole-		Work to improve social cohesion needs to	
	of-government		recognise Aotearoa New Zealand's bicultural	
	approach to building		foundations and be based on Te Tiriti o	
	social cohesion,		Waitangi principles, and incorporate Te Ao	
	including social		Māori approaches.	
	inclusion.			

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
29	Social Cohesion –	Minister	This work will be developed over the medium	9(2)(f)(iv)
	Direct the Ministry of	Radhakrishnan	to longer term and will benefit from a mix of	
	Social Development to		both Government and community leadership.	
	discuss and collaborate	MSD, Social	To achieve meaningful change, we will need	
	with communities, civil	Inclusion	to take a highly collaborative and iterative	
	society, local	Oversight	approach, working with our partners to identify	
	government and the	Group	practical activities that will produce tangible	
	private sector on the		results. It will be important to involve all New	
	development of a social		Zealand communities. 9(2)(f)(iv)	
	cohesion strategic			
	framework and the			
	monitoring and			
	evaluation regime.			
	Social Cohesion –	Minister Hipkins	The Ministry for Ethnic Communities will be	
30	Investigate the	(Public Service)	formally established on 1 July 2021.	
	machinery of	1		
	government options for	Minister		
	an agency focused on	Radhakrishnan		
	ethnic communities and	(DIEC)		
	multiculturalism.			
		Te Kawa		
		Mataaho, DIEC		

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
31	Social Cohesion – Prioritise the development of appropriate measures and indicators (such as the Living Standards Framework) of social cohesion, including social inclusion.	Minister Radhakrishnan MSD, Social Inclusion Oversight Group	There is a designated lead in MSD to progress this work. Work on this initiative is closely linked to work on recommendation 29.	9(2)(f)(iv)
32	Social Cohesion – Prioritise the collection of data on ethnic and religious demographics to support analysis and advice on the implications of NZ's rapidly changing society, inform better policy making and enhance policy evaluation.	Minister Clark Stats NZ, DIA (OEC)	The implications of this recommendation need to be carefully considered before being implemented in full. Data on personal topics such as ethnicity and religious affiliation are deemed to be sensitive information, which requires being very clear on why it is being collected and how it will be used (e.g. for statistical purposes versus operational use).  We would recommend that Privacy Impact Assessments be conducted before agencies decide to routinely collect this sort of information.  In addition to the legality of data collection, agencies must also consider their social licence to routinely collect this information.	

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
33	Workforce Diversity – Direct Chief Executives of agencies involved in counter-terrorism to significantly increase diversity in workforce and in senior leadership.	Minister Hipkins Te Kawa Mataaho	Work is underway to reaffirm this expectation to Chief Executives of counter-terrorism agencies within the core Public Service.  There is ongoing work that will provide support to all Public Service agencies including the agencies involved in counter-terrorism, to increase their workforce diversity, particularly at senior leadership levels i.e. Career Boards and mentoring programmes  Advice will be developed seeking the Public Service Commissioners' agreement to the proposed approach to fulfil this recommendation. This work is in-train, and timeframes are still being developed.  Police is developing a workforce strategy to ensure we have the right people capability over the next 3-5 years, including cultural and community specialists because of the important role they have in delivering policing services to our communities.	9(2)(f)(iv)

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
			Police is also developing an Inclusion	9(2)(f)(iv)
			Strategy. This is focused on our Be Fair	
			Campaign (ensuring our people are fair to all),	
			addressing unconscious bias, and developing	
			our cultural competency and confidence.	
34	Performance –	Minister Hipkins	Papa Pounamu was established in 2017, to	
	Encourage the Public		bring together diversity and inclusion practices	
	Service Commissioner	Te Kawa	across the Public Service and to support	
	to publish annual	Mataaho	Public Service chief executives to meet their	
	reporting on the		diversity and inclusion obligations and goals.	
	progress made by			
	agencies against the		Public Service Chief Executives are required	
	Papa Pounamu		to report on progress against the Papa	
	commitments,		Pounamu commitments in their Annual	
	particularly to show		Reports, which will be publicly available from	
	progress made by		August / September 2021.	
	public service agencies			
	involved in counter-		Scoping is underway to determine how best to	
	terrorism.		consolidate the existing Diversity and	
			Inclusion reporting against the Papa Pounamu	
			commitments for publication on an annual	
			basis	

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
35	Workforce Diversity – Encourage the Public Service Commissioner to continue focusing efforts on significantly increasing workforce diversity and attracting diverse talent for Public service leadership roles at the first, second and third-tiers.	Minister Hipkins Te Kawa Mataaho	The Public Service Commissioner has refreshed performance expectations for public service chief executives to explicitly state they must grow a workforce that reflects the full diversity of New Zealand society as well as implement and report annually on their diversity and inclusion Papa Pounamu commitments.  Work is underway to investigate the existing programme of work and any new initiatives and changes to system settings that can ensure that diversity in tiers 1-3 leadership is increased at pace – this will have a focus on ethnic diversity in the first instance.	9(2)(f)(iv)

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
36	Diversity and Social	Minister Hipkins	The Ministry of Education is working with the	9(2)(f)(iv)
	Cohesion – Invest in		Islamic Women's Council NZ on the following	
	opportunities for young	MoE, MSD	projects:	
	New Zealanders to		<ul> <li>Development of 5 children's</li> </ul>	
	learn about their role,		books to support grief, loss and	
	rights and		the feeling of being in a new	
	responsibilities and on		place. The books have been	
	the value of ethnic and		written by a Muslim teacher who	
	religious diversity,		lost whānau in the 15 March	
	inclusivity, conflict		2019 attacks. The books will be	
	resolution, civic literacy		available in both digital and print	
	and self regulation.		and published in English and	
			Arabic with illustrations of people	
			wearing traditional Islamic dress.	
			Supporting materials are	
			available for whānau to support	
			literacy and child wellbeing. The	
			books will be supplied to schools	
			August '21, with hopefully a	
			digital version of the first book	
			available for 15 March '21.	

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
			<ul> <li>Creation of posters to be displayed in educational settings featuring Muslim women wearing traditional dress. The posters will reinforce the positive impact of diversity in education and support social cohesion.</li> <li>The Ministry of Education has further work underway to create more inclusive and accepting learning environments including:         <ul> <li>Developing resources on Civics and Civics Education</li> <li>Partnering with schools and communities to prepare for Aotearoa New Zealand's Histories being taught as part of the curriculum in all schools and kura by 2022.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	9(2)(f)(iv)

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
			_	9(2)(f)(iv)

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
			<ul> <li>Funding for up to 40 Curriculum Leads in the regions to give effect and visibility to new tools and resources.</li> <li>The commitment to provide safe and inclusive learning environments that accept and value the diversity of all ākonga and their families and communities existed prior to the terror attacks of 15 March, and work to support this was already underway in schools and kura.</li> <li>Through our implementation of recommendation 36 we seek to build on this work and access further funding to deliver a suite of initiatives that address harmful attitudes and behaviours that can strengthen our work to improve social cohesion in a school community setting that include:</li> </ul>	9(2)(f)(iv)

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
			Moving towards mixed-ability grouping for teaching and learning     9(2)(f)(iv)      Developing further curriculum and teaching and learning resources that include cross curriculum approaches to inclusion, diversity and belonging     9(2)(f)(iv)	9(2)(f)(iv)

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
37	Social Cohesion –	Minister	Work on this recommendation will be closely	9(2)(f)(iv)
	Create opportunities for	Radhakrishnan	linked with how we go about working with a	
	regular public		broad range of communities to develop a	
	conversations led by		social cohesion strategic framework, including	
	the responsible	MSD, Social	an evaluation and monitoring regime.	
	minister – the Minister	Inclusion		
	for Social Development	Oversight		
	and Employment – for	Group	Following scoping work with Minister	
	all New Zealanders to		Radhakrishnan officials will provide advice on	
	share knowledge and		options for creating and supporting these	
	improve their		conversations.	
	understanding of:			
	a) Social cohesion			
	including social			
	inclusion and the		. (/)	
	collective effort			
	required to achieve			
	these; and			
	b) The value that			
	ethnic and religious			
	diversity can			
	contribute to a well-			
	functioning society.			

#	Theme /	Lead Minister	Update	Upcoming Milestone
	Recommendation	and lead agency		
38	NZ Public Service –	Minister Hipkins	A draft engagement checklist has been	9(2)(f)(iv)
	require all public		developed by DPMC (the Policy project) for	
	service community	DPMC	initial testing with officials undertaking	
	engagement to be in		engagement as part of the Royal Commission	
	accordance with the		response. This builds on, summarises, and	
	Open Government		provides a practical tool to implement the	
	Partnership		existing guidance on the IAP2 Public	
	commitments and		Participation Spectrum.	
	better utilise the		$\wedge \vee$	
	'Involve and		Feedback will be collected and the checklist	
	Collaborate' pillars of		updated by the end of March.	
	the IAP2 Public		Y	
	Participation Spectrum.			
39	Hate Crime – Amend	Minister Faafoi	Work on this recommendation will commence	
	legislation to create		later in 2021.	
	hate-motivated	MoJ		
	offences in:			
	<ul> <li>The Summary</li> </ul>			
	Offences Act 1981			
	that correspond with			
	the existing offences			
	of offensive			
	behaviour or			
	language, assault,			
	wilful damage and			
	intimidation; and			

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
	The Crimes Act     1961 that     correspond with the     existing offences of     assaults, arson and     intentional damage.			9(2)(f)(iv)
40	Hate Speech – Repeal section 131 of the Human Rights Act 1993 and insert a provision in the Crimes Act 1961 for an offence of inciting racial or religious disharmony, based on an intent to stir up, maintain or normalise hatred, through threatening, abusive or insulting communications with protected characteristics that include religious affiliation.	Minister Faafoi MoJ	In December 2020, Cabinet agreed in principle to several changes to the Human Rights Act 1993 and a change to the Crimes Act 1961 to strengthen protections against hate speech.  The Minister of Justice agreed to targeted engagement with community groups likely to experience hate speech $9(2)(f)(iv)$ . MoJ are liaising with DPMC on our engagement plan to ensure it is aligned with other engagement regarding the recommendations.	

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
41	Classifications –	Minister Tinetti	The Department of Internal Affairs is in	9(2)(f)(iv)
	Amend the definition of		discussion with the Ministry of Justice as to	
	"Objectionable" in	DIA, MoJ	potential for joint policy and legislation	
	section 3 of Films,		vehicles, due to overlap in related work areas	
	Videos, and		(Ministry of Justice is progressing work on	
	Publications		incitement provisions). <sup>9(2)(f)(iv)</sup>	
	Classification Act 1993			
	to include racial			
	superiority, racial		$\wedge \vee$	
	hatred and racial			
	discrimination.			
42	Hate Crime – Direct	Minister	Te Raranga is a four-year programme to	
	Police to revise the	Williams	formalise Police's policy approach and	
	ways in which they		operational practice that oversees and drives	
	record complaints of	Police, DIA	improvements in frontline practice to identify,	
	criminal conduct to		record, and manage hate crime, and deliver a	
	capture systematically		service that is more responsive to victims. The	
	hate-motivations for		programme will consolidate and expedite the	
	offending and train		work that has been led by multiple groups	
	frontline staff in:		across Police.	
			Te Raranga aims to weave people, whānau	
			and communities together with a shared	
			understanding of each other to:	

#	Theme /	Lead Minister	Update	Upcoming Milestone
	Recommendation	and lead agency		
	a. Identifying bias		reduce incidents of hate crime and	9(2)(f)(iv)
	indicators so that		support those affected by the hurt of hate	
	they can identify		crime;	
	potential hate		to lift Police response, through the	
	crimes when they		weaving together of lived experience,	
	perceive that an		systems and training design; and	
	offence is hate-		3. to provide access and support to a	
	motivated;		restoration process for those affected by	
	b. Exploring		hate crime.	
	perceptions of			
	victims and			
	witnesses so that			
	they are in a			
	position to record			
	where an offence is		. (/)	
	perceived to be			
	hate-motivated.			
43	Response	Prime Minister	Minister Little was appointed as Lead	Completed
	implementation –	Ardern	Coordination Minister for the Government's	
	appointment of a		Response to the Royal Commission's Report	
	Minister to lead and	Prime Minister's	into the Terrorist Attack on the Christchurch	
	coordinate the	Office/DPMC	Mosques on 8 December 2020.	
	response to and			
	implementation of the			
	report's	•		
	recommendation.			

#	Theme / Recommendation	Lead Minister and lead agency	Update	Upcoming Milestone
44	Response implementation –	Minister Little	Work to establish an Implementation Oversight Advisory Group is underway. More	9(2)(f)(iv)
	establish an Implementation Oversight Advisory	DPMC	detail on this recommendation is provided in the body of the Cabinet paper.	
	Group			



# **Cabinet**

## Minute of Decision

This document contains information for the New Zealand Cabinet. It must be treated in confidence and handled in accordance with any security classification, or other endorsement. The information can only be released, including under the Official Information Act 1982, by persons with the appropriate authority.

# Government Response to the Royal Commission of Inquiry into the Terrorist Attack on Christchurch Masjidain: First Report Back

Portfolio Government's Response to the Royal Commission's Report into the Terrorist Attack on the Christchurch Mosques

On 8 March 2021, Cabinet:

- noted that in December 2020, Cabinet agreed with the findings and agreed in-principle with the recommendations of the Royal Commission of Inquiry into the terrorist attack on Christchurch masjidain (the Royal Commission) [CAB-20-MIN-0516];
- agreed that a phased approach to the government's response to the Royal Commission is appropriate, with top priorities those directly related to support to affected communities and implementation mechanisms to enable the response and community input;
- noted that between December 2020 and February 2021, the Lead Coordination Minister for the Government's Response to the Royal Commission's Report into the Terrorist Attack on the Christchurch Mosques (the lead Minister) and the Minister for Diversity, Inclusion and Ethnic Communities led a nation-wide programme of hui to listen to community concerns and ensure that the government's response aligns with communities' needs;
- 4 **noted** that a summary of the hui feedback will be published in English and Arabic on the Department of Prime Minister and Cabinet (DPMC) website;
- agreed that the Implementation Oversight Advisory Group will function as a Ministerial Advisory Group, providing advice directly to the Lead Minister;
- agreed that nominations for the Implementation Oversight Advisory Group will be called for by 15 March 2021, with initial costs met from DPMC baselines;
- agreed that a contestable Community Capacity Building Initiative fund be established, with initial establishment funding from DPMC baselines, that ethnic and minority faith communities can access in order to both support individual initiatives as well as building long-term capability to contribute to the Royal Commission response;
- agreed that the Community Capacity Building Initiative fund be administered by the Department of Internal Affairs, with applications assessed by DPMC and the Ministry for Ethnic Communities;
- agreed that a review of the Community Capacity Building Initiative fund be undertaken after two years, including which groups have accessed it and the capacity that has been built accordingly, in order to determine the ongoing need for this support;

noted that undertaking a strategic review of national security settings culminating in a strategy for how government – in partnership with the public – will pursue national security aims, and developing a social cohesion strategic framework, are critical to giving effect to the Royal Commission's recommendations and intent;

#### 11 **noted** that:

- 11.1 the Ministry of Social Development intends to open nominations for the Collective Impact Board on or soon after 15 March 2021 and have the Board operational in early May 2021;
- the intensive case management service through which support has been provided to people affected by the attack remains in place and will be enhanced and developed, guided by the Collective Impact Board once established;
- endorsed the definition of a socially cohesive society, as outlined in the Royal Commission's Report, as one where all individuals and groups have a sense of:
  - 12.1 belonging being part of a community, trust in others and respect for the law;
  - 12.2 inclusion equity of opportunities and outcomes;
  - 12.3 participation in social, community, political and civic life;
  - 12.4 recognition valuing diversity and respecting difference;
  - 12.5 legitimacy confidence in public institutions;
- noted that the Associate Minister for Social Development and Employment will lead a programme of short, medium and longer term work to improve social cohesion (9(2)(f)(iv)):
- 14 **noted** that the Minister for Diversity, Inclusion and Ethnic Communities will submit a Cabinet paper prior to the establishment of the Ministry for Ethnic Communities on 1 July 2021 making recommendations about its functions and responsibilities;
- **noted** that bids for placements in the July intake of the Ethnic Communities Graduate Programme are encouraged by all departments to ensure full subscription;
- invited the Public Service Commissioner to progress the appointment of a chief executive to lead the Ministry for Ethnic Communities from 1 July 2021, as soon as possible;
- 17 **noted** the importance of New Zealand's bicultural foundations and of building on Te Tiriti o Waitangi Principles and Te Ao Māori approaches to achieve a socially cohesive society;
- 18 noted that the Minister for the Public Service and the Associate Minister for Social Development and Employment will lead work to contribute to the government response to the Royal Commission Report to address discrimination in employment in the public and private sectors;
- 19 noted that the Associate Minister for Social Development and Employment is leading the development of the Refugees, Recent Migrants and Ethnic Communities Employment Action Plan to bring together key work programmes and propose new actions to create a better labour market connection for a range of migrant and ethnic communities;

- 20 **noted** that the Ministry of Education regionally allocates funds for Professional Learning and Development (PLD) opportunities, and cultural capability is now one of four new priorities that underpin regionally-allocated PLD in English medium settings;
- noted that the Minister of Education and Associate Minister of Education (Hon Jan Tinetti) will report back to Cabinet before the end of the year with proposals on how to support whole school communities as they work together to build caring and inclusive cultures, including work to promote wellbeing and prevent and respond to racism, discrimination and bullying, including how government might respond to the specific request heard in hui for religious and cultural diversity (but not proselytisation) to be taught in schools;
- noted that the Minister for Broadcasting and Media will seek to see how he can assist facilitating a constructive dialogue between media organisations and the Muslim community regarding that community's concern about the role of media in perpetuating harmful portrayals of Muslims, or not portraying them at all;
- 23 **noted** that quarterly updates on consideration and implementation of the Royal Commission's report will be provided to the Prime Minister and Minister for National Security and Intelligence, Minister of Finance, Minister of Education, Minister for Social Development and Employment, Minister of Foreign Affairs, Minister of Police, Minister of Justice and Immigration, Minister of Internal Affairs, Minister of Customs, and Minister for Diversity, Inclusion and Ethnic Communities as the suite of Responsible Ministers;
- 24 **noted** that the lead Minister will report to Cabinet with an update on consideration and implementation of the Royal Commission's recommendations and intent before the end of 2021.

Martin Bell for Secretary of the Cabinet